# Machine Learning for Data Science (CS4786) Lecture 23

#### Message Passing and Learning in Graphical Models

Course Webpage :

http://www.cs.cornell.edu/Courses/cs4786/2016fa/

# Announcements

- Survey 2 is out, due by Nov 26th
- Topics lecture after thanksgiving on "Fair and unbiased in machine learning"



































	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Y
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Р	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	-1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	-	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	-1	0	-1
13	0	0	1	0	-1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	-	0	-



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	-1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	1	0	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	0	1	0	-1
2	0	1	0	1	0
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	0	0	0	0
5	0	0	1	0	0
6	0	0	1	0	1
7	0	0	0	0	0
8	0	0	1	0	1
9	0	0	0	0	0
10	0	0	1	0	1
11	0	0	1	0	0
12	0	0	1	0	1
13	0	0	1	0	1
14	0	0	0	0	0
15	0	0	0	0	0
16	0	0	1	0	0
17	0	0	0	0	0
18	0	0	0	0	0
19	0	0	0	0	0
20	0	0	0	0	0
21	0	0	0	0	0
22	0	0	0	0	0
23	0	0	0	0	0
24	0	0	0	0	0
25	0	0	-	0	-1



























	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	1	0	1	0



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	1	0	1	0
2	0	1	1	1	1
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	1	0	1	1
5	0	1	0	1	1
6	0	1	0	1	1
7	0	1	1	1	1
8	0	1	0	1	0
9	0	1	0	1	1
10	0	1	1	1	1
11	0	1	0	1	1
12	0	1	1	1	0
13	0	1	0	1	1
14	0	1	1	1	1
15	0	1	0	1	1
16	0	1	0	1	1
17	0	1	0	1	1
18	0	1	0	1	1
19	0	1	1	1	1
20	0	1	0	1	1
21	0	1	0	1	1
22	0	1	0	1	1
23	0	1	1	1	1
24	0	1	0	1	1
25	0	1	1	1	1


	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	1	0	1	0
2	0	1	1	1	1
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	1	0	1	1
5	0	1	0	1	1
6	0	1	0	1	1
7	0	1	1	1	1
8	0	1	0	1	0
9	0	1	0	1	1
10	0	1	1	1	1
11	0	1	0	1	1
12	0	1	1	1	0
13	0	1	0	1	1
14	0	1	1	1	1
15	0	1	0	1	1
16	0	1	0	1	1
17	0	1	0	1	1
18	0	1	0	1	1
19	0	1	1	1	1
20	0	1	0	1	1
21	0	1	0	1	1
22	0	1	0	1	1
23	0	1	1	1	1
24	0	1	0	1	1
25	0	1	1	1	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ
1	0	1	0	1	0
2	0	1	1	1	1
3	1	1	1	1	1
4	0	1	0	1	1
5	0	1	0	1	1
6	0	1	0	1	1
7	0	1	1	1	1
8	0	1	0	1	0
9	0	1	0	1	1
10	0	1	1	1	1
11	0	1	0	1	1
12	0	1	1	1	0
13	0	1	0	1	1
14	0	1	1	1	1
15	0	1	0	1	1
16	0	1	0	1	1
17	0	1	0	1	1
18	0	1	0	1	1
19	0	1	1	1	1
20	0	1	0	1	1
21	0	1	0	1	1
22	0	1	0	1	1
23	0	1	1	1	1
24	0	1	0	1	1
25	0	1	1	1	1



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ	Weight
1	0	1	0	1	0	
2	0	1	1	1	1	
3	1	1	1	1	1	
4	0	1	0	1	1	
5	0	1	0	1	1	
6	0	1	0	1	1	
7	0	1	1	1	1	
8	0	1	0	1	0	
9	0	1	0	1	1	
10	0	1	1	1	1	
11	0	1	0	1	1	
12	0	1	1	1	0	
13	0	1	0	1	1	
14	0	1	1	1	1	
15	0	1	0	1	1	
16	0	1	0	1	1	
17	0	1	0	1	1	
18	0	1	0	1	1	
19	0	1	1	1	1	
20	0	1	0	1	1	
21	0	1	0	1	1	
22	0	1	0	1	1	
23	0	1	1	1	1	
24	0	1	0	1	1	
25	0	1	1	1	1	



	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ	Weight
1	0	1	0	1	0	
2	0	1	1	1	1	
3	1	1	1	1	1	
4	0	1	0	1	1	
5	0	1	0	1	1	
6	0	1	0	1	1	
7	0	1	1	1	1	
8	0	1	0	1	0	
9	0	1	0	1	1	
10	0	1	1	1	1	
11	0	1	0	1	1	
12	0	1	1	1	0	
13	0	1	0	1	1	
14	0	1	1	1	1	
15	0	1	0	1	1	
16	0	1	0	1	1	
17	0	1	0	1	1	
18	0	1	0	1	1	
19	0	1	1	1	1	
20	0	1	0	1	1	
21	0	1	0	1	1	
22	0	1	0	1	1	
23	0	1	1	1	1	
24	0	1	0	1	1	
25	0	1	1	1	1	





	F	CS	GS	Ρ	Υ	Weight
1	0	1	0	1	0	0.1
2	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
3	1	1	1	1	1	0.99
4	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
5	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
6	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
7	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
8	0	1	0	1	0	0.1
9	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
10	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
11	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
12	0	1	1	1	0	0.1
13	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
14	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
15	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
16	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
17	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
18	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
19	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
20	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
21	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
22	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
23	0	1	1	1	1	0.1
24	0	1	0	1	1	0.1
25	0	1	1	1	1	0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1

0.1



- We really want to draw from distribution *P*.
- But we can only draw from distribution *Q* easily
- Trick:
  - Draw  $x_1, \ldots, x_n \sim Q$
  - Re-weight each sample  $x_t$  by  $P(X = x_t)/Q(X = x_t)$

$$\mathbb{E}_{X\sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$

$$\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$
$$= \sum_{x} Q(X = x) \left(\frac{P(X = x)}{Q(X = x)}f(x)\right)$$

$$\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$
$$= \sum_{x} Q(X = x) \left(\frac{P(X = x)}{Q(X = x)}f(x)\right)$$
$$= \mathbb{E}_{X \sim Q}\left[\frac{P(X)}{Q(X)}f(X)\right]$$

$$\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$
$$= \sum_{x} Q(X = x) \left(\frac{P(X = x)}{Q(X = x)}f(x)\right)$$
$$= \mathbb{E}_{X \sim Q}\left[\frac{P(X)}{Q(X)}f(X)\right]$$
$$\approx \frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=1}^{n}\frac{P(X = x_t)}{Q(X = x_t)}f(x_t)$$

• Why does it work?

$$\mathbb{E}_{X\sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$
  
=  $\sum_{x} Q(X = x) \left(\frac{P(X = x)}{Q(X = x)}f(x)\right)$   
=  $\mathbb{E}_{X\sim Q}\left[\frac{P(X)}{Q(X)}f(X)\right]$   
 $\approx \frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=1}^{n}\frac{P(X = x_t)}{Q(X = x_t)}f(x_t)$ 

• Example:  $f(X) = \mathbf{1}\{X \in \text{Set}\}$ , then  $\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = P(X \in \text{Set})$ 

$$\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = \sum_{x} P(X = x)f(x)$$
  
=  $\sum_{x} Q(X = x) \left(\frac{P(X = x)}{Q(X = x)}f(x)\right)$   
=  $\mathbb{E}_{X \sim Q}\left[\frac{P(X)}{Q(X)}f(X)\right]$   
 $\approx \frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=1}^{n}\frac{P(X = x_t)}{Q(X = x_t)}f(x_t)$ 

- Example:  $f(X) = \mathbf{1}\{X \in \text{Set}\}$ , then  $\mathbb{E}_{X \sim P}[f(X)] = P(X \in \text{Set})$
- Hence, using importance weighted sampling,

$$P(X \in \mathbf{Set}) \approx \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1} \{ x_t \in \mathbf{Set} \} \frac{P(X=x_t)}{Q(X=x_t)}$$





## $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$





## $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$



## $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$







## $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$

 $Set = \{2, 4, 6\}$ 





#### $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$

 $\mathsf{Set} = \{2, 4, 6\}$ 

What is P(even)?





 $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$ 

 $Set = \{2, 4, 6\}$ 

What is P(even)?

$$\frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1}\{x_t \in \{2,4,6\}\} \frac{P(x_t)}{Q(x_t)} = \frac{1}{n}\sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1}\{x_t \in \{2,4,6\}\} \frac{0.1/5}{1/6}$$





 $P(1) = 0.9, \quad \forall j \neq 1 \ P(j) = 0.1/5$ 

 $Set = \{2, 4, 6\}$ 

What is P(even)?

$$\frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1} \{ x_t \in \{2, 4, 6\} \} \frac{P(x_t)}{Q(x_t)} = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1} \{ x_t \in \{2, 4, 6\} \} \frac{0.1/5}{1/6}$$
$$= 0.12 \times \frac{1}{n} \sum_{t=1}^{n} \mathbf{1} \{ x_t \in \{2, 4, 6\} \} \approx 0.12 \times 0.5 = 0.06$$

#### Likelihood weighting:

```
Topologically sort variables (parents first children later)

For t = 1 to n (number of samples)

Set w_t = 1

For i = 1 to N (number of variables)

If X_i is observed,

Set w_t \leftarrow w_t \cdot P(X_i = x_i | \text{Parents}(X_i) = \text{ already sampled})

Set x_i^t = x_i (the observed value)

Else, sample x_i^t \sim P(X_i | \text{Parents}(X_i) = \text{ already sampled})

End For
```

End For

Output,

 $P(\text{Variable} = \text{value}|\text{Observation}) = \frac{\sum_{t=1}^{n} w_t \mathbf{1}\{\text{Variable} = \text{value}\}}{\sum_{t=1}^{n} w_t}$ 



#### Example:



## Example:

# But you don't observe location (dark room)



Example:

on

But you don't observe location (dark room)

You hear how close the bot is!



Example:

(dark room)

But you don't observe location

You hear how close the bot is!



## What you hear:



Example:

(dark room)

But you don't observe location

You hear how close the bot is!







Can you catch the Bot?



Xt's are what you hear (observation)

St's are the unseen locations (states)

Eg: for m x m grid we have,  $K = m^2$  states Number of alphabets = # colors you can observe



Eg: for m x m grid we have,  $K = m^2$  states



Eg: for m x m grid we have,  $K = m^2$  states

Transition matrix is K x K (too large)



Eg: for m x m grid we have,  $K = m^2$  states

Transition matrix is K x K (too large)

Use sampling to do approximate inference Number of samples  $n << m^4$ 






















































**MII)** 

#### Eg: say observations were









Rejection sampling: Reject samples that don't match observations





Rejection sampling: Reject samples that don't match observations

Most samples rejected

#### Eg: say observations were







## Eg: say observations were



Importance weighting: weight samples

### Eg: say observations were



Importance weighting: weight samples



Importance weighting: weight samples















**D**)))















**D**)))



**D**)))

# Use multiple samples and track each ones weights. P( X<sub>1</sub>) P( X<sub>2</sub>) P( X<sub>3</sub>) P( X<sub>3</sub>) P( X<sub>5</sub>) P( X<sub>5</sub>) P( X<sub>4</sub>)

• This is same as 6 separate samples

**D**)))

- This is same as 6 separate samples
- Instead of tracking each sample's weight, resample according to weights












































**MII)** 







**D**)))



**D))** 

# Use multiple samples and track each ones weights. Image: P(Image: X\_1) P(Image: X\_2) P(Image: X\_3) P(Image: X\_5) P(Image: X\_5) P(Image: X\_4)

 On every round, transfer particles from previous states according to transition probability

**MII)** 

# Use multiple samples and track each ones weights. Image: A state of the state of th

- On every round, transfer particles from previous states according to transition probability
- Resample particles according to P(observation|state)

**MII)** 

# Use multiple samples and track each ones weights. Image: A state of the state of th

- On every round, transfer particles from previous states according to transition probability
- Resample particles according to P(observation|state)
- Use new particles to proceed

- Inference time only depends on number of samples
- Of course more the samples the better accuracy
- Often we don't need too many samples. Why ?

# Gibbs Sampling

- Repeat n times for, n samples,
  - Start with arbitrary value for variables
  - Replace each variable by new sample from P(Variable| all other variables)
  - Go over all variables multiple times
  - Return final sample of the N variables

## VARIATIONAL INFERENCE

- Basic idea: we want to infer *P*(Unobserved|Observed)
  We create a new parametric distribution *Q*<sub>θ</sub>(Unobserved) where
  θ is picked based on Obervations
- We pick  $\theta$  such that,  $Q_{\theta}$  is close to P(Unobserved|Observed)
- Closeness measured using KL divergence
- Mean-field approximation,

$$Q_{\theta}(X_1,\ldots,X_m) = \prod_{j=1}^m Q_{\theta_j}(X_j)$$