

CS 4110

Programming Languages & Logics

Lecture 16
Fixed-Point Combinators



Termination in the λ -calculus

We have encoded lots of useful programming functionality that produces values.

Does every closed λ -term eventually terminate under CBN evaluation?

$$\forall \text{ closed term } e. \exists e'. e \rightarrow^* e' \wedge e' \not\rightarrow ?$$

Termination in the λ -calculus

We have encoded lots of useful programming functionality that produces values.

Does every closed λ -term eventually terminate under CBN evaluation?

$$\forall \text{ closed term } e. \exists e'. e \rightarrow^* e' \wedge e' \not\rightarrow ?$$

No!

$$\Omega \triangleq (\lambda x. x x) (\lambda x. x x)$$

Termination in the λ -calculus

We have encoded lots of useful programming functionality that produces values.

Does every closed λ -term eventually terminate under CBN evaluation?

$$\forall \text{ closed term } e. \exists e'. e \rightarrow^* e' \wedge e' \not\rightarrow ?$$

No!

$$\begin{aligned}\Omega &\triangleq (\lambda x. x x) (\lambda x. x x) \\ &\rightarrow (x x) \{(\lambda x. x x)/x\} \\ &= (\lambda x. x x) (\lambda x. x x) \\ &= \Omega\end{aligned}$$

Recursive Functions

How would we write recursive functions, like factorial?

Recursive Functions

How would we write recursive functions, like factorial?

We'd like to write it like this...

$$\text{FACT} \triangleq \lambda n. \text{IF (ISZERO } n) 1 (\text{TIMES } n (\text{FACT (PRED } n)))$$

Recursive Functions

How would we write recursive functions, like factorial?

We'd like to write it like this...

$$\text{FACT} \triangleq \lambda n. \text{IF } (\text{ISZERO } n) \text{ 1 } (\text{TIMES } n \text{ (FACT (PRED } n)))$$

In slightly more readable notation this is...

$$\text{FACT} \triangleq \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times \text{FACT } (n - 1)}$$

...but this is an equation, not a definition!

Recursion removal trick

We can perform a “trick” to define a function FACT that satisfies the recursive equation on the previous slide.

Recursion removal trick

We can perform a “trick” to define a function FACT that satisfies the recursive equation on the previous slide.

Define a new function FACT' that takes a function f as an argument. Then, for “recursive” calls, it uses $f f$:

$$\text{FACT}' \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times ((f f) (n - 1))$$

Recursion removal trick

We can perform a “trick” to define a function FACT that satisfies the recursive equation on the previous slide.

Define a new function FACT' that takes a function f as an argument. Then, for “recursive” calls, it uses $f f$:

$$\text{FACT}' \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times ((f f) (n - 1))$$

Then define FACT as FACT' applied to itself:

$$\text{FACT} \triangleq \text{FACT}' \ \text{FACT}'$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

FACT 3

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\text{FACT } 3 = (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if } n = 0 \mathbf{ then } 1 \mathbf{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1)))) \text{FACT}' 3\end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((f f) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3\end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3 \\ &\rightarrow \mathbf{\text{if } 3 = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1))} \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3 \\ &\rightarrow \mathbf{\text{if } 3 = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1))} \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1)) \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3 \\ &\rightarrow \mathbf{\text{if } 3 = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1))} \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1)) \\ &= 3 \times (\text{FACT } (3 - 1)) \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3 \\ &\rightarrow \mathbf{\text{if } 3 = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1))} \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1)) \\ &= 3 \times (\text{FACT } (3 - 1)) \\ &\rightarrow \dots \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times 2 \times 1 \times 1 \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's try evaluating FACT on 3...

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT } 3 &= (\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') 3 \\ &= ((\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((ff) (n - 1))}) \text{FACT}') 3 \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda n. \mathbf{\text{if } n = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } n \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (n - 1))}) 3 \\ &\rightarrow \mathbf{\text{if } 3 = 0 \text{ then } 1 \text{ else } 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1))} \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times ((\text{FACT}' \text{ FACT}') (3 - 1)) \\ &= 3 \times (\text{FACT } (3 - 1)) \\ &\rightarrow \dots \\ &\rightarrow 3 \times 2 \times 1 \times 1 \\ &\rightarrow^* 6 \end{aligned}$$

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions.
Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions.
Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

There is another way: fixed points!

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions. Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

There is another way: fixed points!

Consider factorial again. It is a fixed point of the following:

$$G \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times (f(n - 1))$$

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions. Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

There is another way: fixed points!

Consider factorial again. It is a fixed point of the following:

$$G \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times (f(n - 1))$$

Recall that if g is a fixed point of G , then $G g = g$. To see that any fixed point g is a real factorial function, try evaluating it:

$$g \ 5 = (G g) \ 5$$

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions. Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

There is another way: fixed points!

Consider factorial again. It is a fixed point of the following:

$$G \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times (f(n - 1))$$

Recall that if g is a fixed point of G , then $G g = g$. To see that any fixed point g is a real factorial function, try evaluating it:

$$\begin{aligned} g \ 5 &= (G g) \ 5 \\ &\rightarrow^* 5 \times (g \ 4) \end{aligned}$$

Fixed point combinators

Our “trick” requires following human-readable instructions. Write a different function f' that takes itself as an argument and uses self-application for recursive calls, and then define f as $f' f'$.

There is another way: fixed points!

Consider factorial again. It is a fixed point of the following:

$$G \triangleq \lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if} \ n = 0 \ \mathbf{then} \ 1 \ \mathbf{else} \ n \times (f(n - 1))$$

Recall that if g is a fixed point of G , then $G g = g$. To see that any fixed point g is a real factorial function, try evaluating it:

$$\begin{aligned} g \ 5 &= (G g) \ 5 \\ &\rightarrow^* 5 \times (g \ 4) \\ &= 5 \times ((G g) \ 4) \end{aligned}$$

Fixed point combinators

How can we generate the fixed point of G ?

In denotational semantics, finding fixed points took a lot of math. In the λ -calculus, we just need a suitable combinator...

Y Combinator

The (infamous) Y combinator is defined as

$$Y \triangleq \lambda f. (\lambda x. f(x x)) (\lambda x. f(x x))$$

We say that Y is a *fixed point combinator* because Y f is a fixed point of f (for any lambda term f).

Y Combinator

The (infamous) Y combinator is defined as

$$Y \triangleq \lambda f. (\lambda x. f (x x)) (\lambda x. f (x x))$$

We say that Y is a *fixed point combinator* because Y f is a fixed point of f (for any lambda term f).

What happens when we evaluate Y G under CBV?

Z Combinator

To avoid this issue, we'll use a slight variant of the Y combinator, called Z, which is easier to use under CBV.

Z Combinator

To avoid this issue, we'll use a slight variant of the Y combinator, called Z, which is easier to use under CBV.

$$Z \triangleq \lambda f. (\lambda x. f(\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f(\lambda y. x x y))$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G .

FACT

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G .

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & \text{Z } G \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f(\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f(\lambda y. x x y))) G \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G \\ \rightarrow & (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

FACT

= Z G

= $(\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G$

→ $(\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))$

→ $G (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G \\ \rightarrow & (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) \\ \rightarrow & G (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y \\ = & (\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (f(n - 1))) \\ & (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

```
FACT
= Z G
= (λf. (λx. f (λy. x x y)) (λx. f (λy. x x y))) G
→ (λx. G (λy. x x y)) (λx. G (λy. x x y))
→ G (λy. (λx. G (λy. x x y)) (λx. G (λy. x x y)) y)
= (λf. λn. if n = 0 then 1 else n × (f (n - 1)))
    (λy. (λx. G (λy. x x y)) (λx. G (λy. x x y)) y)
→ λn. if n = 0 then 1
    else n × ((λy. (λx. G (λy. x x y)) (λx. G (λy. x x y)) y) (n - 1))
```

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G \\ \rightarrow & (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) \\ \rightarrow & G (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) \\ = & (\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (f (n - 1))) \\ & (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) \\ \rightarrow & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \\ & \mathbf{else\ } n \times ((\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) (n - 1)) \\ =_{\beta} & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (\lambda y. (Z G) y) (n - 1) \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G \\ \rightarrow & (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) \\ \rightarrow & G (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) \\ = & (\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (f (n - 1))) \\ & (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) \\ \rightarrow & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \\ & \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times ((\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) y) (n - 1)) \\ =_{\beta} & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (\lambda y. (Z G) y) (n - 1) \\ =_{\beta} & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times ((Z G) (n - 1)) \end{aligned}$$

Example

Let's see Z in action, on our function G.

$$\begin{aligned} & \text{FACT} \\ = & Z G \\ = & (\lambda f. (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. f (\lambda y. x x y))) G \\ \rightarrow & (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) \\ \rightarrow & G (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y \\ = & (\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (f (n - 1))) \\ & (\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y \\ \rightarrow & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \\ & \mathbf{else\ } n \times ((\lambda y. (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y)) (\lambda x. G (\lambda y. x x y))) y) (n - 1) \\ =_{\beta} & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (\lambda y. (Z G) y) (n - 1) \\ =_{\beta} & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times ((Z G) (n - 1)) \\ = & \lambda n. \mathbf{if\ } n = 0 \mathbf{\ then\ } 1 \mathbf{\ else\ } n \times (\text{FACT } (n - 1)) \end{aligned}$$

Other fixed point combinators

There are many (indeed infinitely many) fixed-point combinators. Here's a cute one:

$$Y_k \triangleq (\text{LLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLLL})$$

where

$$L \triangleq \lambda abcdefghijklmnopqrstuvwxyzr. \\ (r(\text{this is a fixed point combinator}))$$

Turing's Fixed Point Combinator

To gain some more intuition for fixed point combinators, let's derive a combinator Θ originally discovered by Turing.

Turing's Fixed Point Combinator

To gain some more intuition for fixed point combinators, let's derive a combinator Θ originally discovered by Turing.

We know that Θf is a fixed point of f , so we have

$$\Theta f = f(\Theta f).$$

Turing's Fixed Point Combinator

To gain some more intuition for fixed point combinators, let's derive a combinator Θ originally discovered by Turing.

We know that Θf is a fixed point of f , so we have

$$\Theta f = f(\Theta f).$$

We can write the following recursive equation:

$$\Theta = \lambda f. f(\Theta f)$$

Turing's Fixed Point Combinator

To gain some more intuition for fixed point combinators, let's derive a combinator Θ originally discovered by Turing.

We know that Θf is a fixed point of f , so we have

$$\Theta f = f(\Theta f).$$

We can write the following recursive equation:

$$\Theta = \lambda f. f(\Theta f)$$

Now use the recursion removal trick:

$$\begin{aligned}\Theta' &\triangleq \lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f) \\ \Theta &\triangleq \Theta' \Theta'\end{aligned}$$

θ Example

$$\text{FACT} = \Theta G$$

θ Example

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT} &= \Theta G \\ &= ((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f))) G\end{aligned}$$

θ Example

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT} &= \Theta G \\ &= ((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f))) G \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda f. f((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) f)) G\end{aligned}$$

θ Example

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT} &= \Theta G \\ &= ((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f))) G \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda f. f((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) f)) G \\ &\rightarrow G((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) G)\end{aligned}$$

θ Example

$$\begin{aligned}\text{FACT} &= \Theta G \\ &= ((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f))) G \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda f. f((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) f)) G \\ &\rightarrow G((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) G) \\ &= G(\Theta G)\end{aligned}$$

θ Example

$$\begin{aligned} \text{FACT} &= \Theta G \\ &= ((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f))) G \\ &\rightarrow (\lambda f. f((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) f)) G \\ &\rightarrow G((\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) (\lambda t. \lambda f. f(t t f)) G) \\ &= G(\Theta G) \\ &= (\lambda f. \lambda n. \mathbf{if } n = 0 \mathbf{ then } 1 \mathbf{ else } n \times (f(n - 1))) (\Theta G) \\ &\rightarrow \lambda n. \mathbf{if } n = 0 \mathbf{ then } 1 \mathbf{ else } n \times ((\Theta G) (n - 1)) \\ &= \lambda n. \mathbf{if } n = 0 \mathbf{ then } 1 \mathbf{ else } n \times (\text{FACT } (n - 1)) \end{aligned}$$